

# Conclusions

---

- 1.1. More than 500 homes is likely to mean more than 1,000 people or more living on a beach, at sea level with sheer cliffs to the rear and only one access road. Such a “new town on a beach” would seem sheer folly in the light of current fears about the effects of climate change - the predicted rise in sea levels and the likelihood of more frequent and severe storms and tidal surges.
- 1.2. Indeed such a scheme is contrary to local, national and international planning policies governing building in areas prone to flooding and in coastal zones - a fact admitted by the developers of the Beach. This application should be decided in the light of those policies which clearly do not support such a development in this location.
- 1.3. The developer claims that the principle of development on these beaches was established by the 1990 consent, the so-called Extant consent. We submit that they cannot use this to justify this new application because there is no likelihood that the Extant can be built. After all, it has not been built in the 21 years since it got planning permission and there must surely be a number of reasons for that. Public promises were uttered during the last Public Inquiry to the effect that if those plans were not passed then the Extant would definitely be built. And that was five years ago. If - as seems certain - the Extant cannot be built then this new application has to stand alone and being contrary to policy, should be rejected.
- 1.4. It is clear that this planning application is a new, stand-alone application to which the discredited 1990 planning permission bears no relevance. This is such a different plan from that presented 21 years ago that little or no comparison can or should be made. Moreover, the deliberately-styled “Hybrid” nature of this application would, if approved, mean that a massive sea wall can be built on one of the best beaches in Cornwall without any clear commitment whatever as to what is to be constructed behind it.

- 1.5. This is a coastal zone which should be protected as one of Cornwall's greatest assets. It is the very coastline and beaches which bring people here in the first place. The proposal would double Carlyon Bay's population and remove a significant part of its open spaces. Despite assurances, it is likely that public access to the beaches will be subject to restrictions at the developers' will. An intolerable burden will be put on our essential services and local infrastructure with an estimated one million extra traffic movements a year on our local roads – an estimate we believe to be understated. That means an 11% increase in traffic on the already saturated A390.
- 1.6. CEG says the benefits of the scheme outweigh the disadvantages, for instance providing hundreds of jobs and “transforming” the fortunes of St Austell. We have argued in these submissions that these claims are based on speculation and are therefore uncertain. We urge decision makers not to be persuaded that dubious claims of short-term benefits are worth the long-term risks in such a scheme as this.
- 1.7. This site is simply not suitable for this scale of development. As we have shown, predictions of the rate of sea level rise are uncertain – at the moment there is nothing to protect, but building 511 homes means expensive sea defences have to be built with consequent on-going costs for future generations. The development creates a problem for future where one does not exist.
- 1.8. We have demonstrated that because of the nature of the make-up of the beach, in order to maintain the intended beach profile, frequent recharges would become essential, especially after storms, not something acknowledged by the developer. This type of beach replenishment has already been rejected as unsustainable after the 2006 Public Inquiry.
- 1.9. In addition to that Public Inquiry, a previous redesign of the Extant scheme was also called in for a Public Inquiry but withdrawn before it could be held. This new application must also be called in.
- 1.10. We submit that this application should be refused in its entirety.

# Contributors to the CarlyonBayWatch Submission

---

CarlyonBayWatch comprises a group of local volunteers who came together following the announcement made in 2002 about the intention to create what effectively would be a new town on St Austell's principal beach. Its position was mandated by over 900 local signatories to its petition sent at that time to the Government Office of the South West. It became incorporated 'by guarantee' after some members of the group became concerned about personal liability in its work.

CarlyonBayWatch have continuously supported development on the beach which is environmentally sensitive, proportionate, safe, sustainable, in scale and restricted to the previously developed 'brownfield site' of the 'pre-war' Coliseum complex on part of Crinnis Beach.

## Contributors

### S R Bennett F.C.A.

Fellow of the Institute of Chartered Accountants in England and Wales.

Past President of the South Western Society of Chartered Accountants.

Past Chairman of the Cornwall and Plymouth Society of Chartered Accountants.

Retired senior partner of firm of registered auditors.

Roy is a Chartered Accountant who has lived, apart from one year, in mid-Cornwall since 1967. He has Cornish ancestors and a great love for the County. He was originally employed in the China Clay industry in the St. Austell area and, at one time, was appointed manager of a china clay pit, refining complex and drying plant, with authority under the Mines and Quarries Act prevailing at the time. Since the mid 1970's he has practiced as a Chartered Accountant with offices in Bodmin, Fowey and St. Austell, rising to senior partner in the practice. In the mid 1980's he was Chairman of the Cornwall and Plymouth Society of Chartered Accountants and in the mid 1990's President of the South West of England Society of Chartered Accountants. He has now retired.

## Dr. Alan Francis

Degree in Geology (Hons) from Nottingham University

Degree in Chemistry from Nottingham University

### Experience

Alan worked for five years for Amalgamated Tin Mines of Nigeria, which at the time was the largest tin mining company in the world under the umbrella of The London Tin Company. He was responsible for the revision of the local geological and mineral maps and also responsible for the mineral identification of economic reserves of tin, columbite, monazite and various semi-heavy minerals. He also had the task of revising the whole of the large reserves of tin and columbite controlled by the company. He tested the efficiency of the tin and columbite gig and hydro-cyclone plants. His last major task was to supervise the drilling and evaluation of a primary tin deposit which, when completed, was worth £6 million at 1965 prices.

On returning to the UK, Alan worked for English China Clays up to retirement in 1995. For the last fifteen years of his time there, he was Chief Production Geologist of the largest china clay production in the world. He was responsible for the drilling and maintaining of the mineral reserves for the company. The reserves had to be maintained at least for a 20-year period to make sure that no depreciation had to be allocated. He logged and supervised the drilling and classification of an average 2,000 feet a month of core drilling. He had detailed experience of sand foundation and water flow in the local sand tips. He explored and assessed the danger of mining sites in tin and copper mining areas under the control of the company. Water supplies were developed and drilled for residential, industrial and farming purposes.

## Peter Browning

Born in Penzance of Cornish parents Peter has live in Carlyon Bay since 1969, bringing up all four of his children here, two of whom still live locally. His wider family, including now six grandchildren, have all used the Carlyon Bay beach continuously since 1969 until the work that started there in 2004 obstructed the easy access previously enjoyed.

His career experience, initially in banking, was mainly in the motor industry, in which he became directly responsible for a staff of nearly 200 people and a new heavy goods vehicle distribution network covering the whole of Cornwall, Devon, and the southern half of Somerset. This included controlling the distribution of new Ford passenger vehicles for mid Cornwall, including St. Austell and Liskeard. He continues to take a keen interest in

matters of transportation, particularly in Cornwall, having served for five years as a member of the Cornwall County Council's Freight Transport Forum. He took an active role in the 2003 St.Austell Transportation Study, and in promoting the case for the dualling of the whole of the A30 trunk route through Cornwall, giving evidence at the Public Inquiry into the Goss Moor section. His work also included becoming the first Registered Insurance Broker in Cornwall.

In 1989, he founded a wholly charitable organisation for local people with learning disability, and continues with that work to this day. He also founded and sponsored the working party for the (then) nascent Carlyon Parish Council. His interests include continuous active involvement in local affairs, having participated in a number of Public Inquiries, notably the November 2006 hearing about the unauthorised Sea Wall.

Peter continues to be a student of the law, having spent 15 years as a lay member of Employment Tribunals.

## Peter Price

Peter is a retired Police Officer having served for thirty years with the Devon and Cornwall Constabulary from 1970 – 2000. During this time he was a member of the Traffic Department for 21 years and was qualified in Police Accident Investigation and Reconstruction Techniques

## Juliet Aylward

Juliet was born in Padstow to a Cornish mother and maternal grandparents. Her mother's family included local farmers and the founder of the cinemas in Padstow and Wadebridge. She went to school in Wadebridge until her father, a Royal Navy officer, was posted to London.

After leaving school she joined the BBC, working during the 1970s as a researcher on the team which produced Radio 4's The World at One, PM and The World This Weekend. During this time, she also enrolled on a part-time four-year degree course at Birkbeck College, University of London, gaining a 2-1 Honours in History.

In 1982 she left radio and joined the team launching the UK's first TV breakfast show, the BBC's Breakfast Time with Frank Bough and Selina Scott. Now a producer, she left Breakfast Time after four years and joined the newsroom of the local TV news programme

London Plus, later working as news editor on Newsroom South East and then a journalist for BBC News Online.

Her parents and brother now having settled in St Austell, she and her husband, Robin, bought their home in Carlyon Bay around 20 years ago. Her mother still lives locally and her brother, sister-in-law and several cousins also live and work in St Austell.

## Robin Malcolm

Starting his working life in chemical research labs, he joined the BBC Engineering Department in the mid-60s before becoming a Studio Manager, working on a variety of programmes from pop and classical music to news and current affairs. He then moved on to become a producer and later editor in the unit that was responsible for the World at One, PM and the World This Weekend. His journalistic skills took him to Scotland at an exciting time with the birth of BBC Radio Scotland. He came back South to take charge - as Director of Programmes - of two commercial speech stations for the London Broadcasting Company, LBC. He has also worked for opinion pollsters NOP and been a director of Marcher Sound, a Welsh commercial radio station. Married to Julie – his Padstow-born wife – they bought a house in Carlyon Bay some 20 years ago where they now live in happy if busy retirement.

## Gloria E Price

Gloria Price has lived in the local area for 44 years attending St Austell Grammar School and St Austell College.

The beach formed a very important part of life. As a parent of two daughters, she took turns in looking after the younger children so that other parents could have a quick swim. A sort of crèche developed over the years as a social network was formed.

Gloria's career included working for English China Clays, and as a Local Government Officer, in the Chief Executive Officer's Department at Restormel Borough Council.

She also became a volunteer in the Citizens Advice Bureau. She has also worked with the late County Councillor Mildred Curtice on educational issues in the mid 1980s. More recently she compiled evidence on public rights of way with the late County Councillor Richard Stewart, several of which have since been added to the map for the area. She was also involved with her husband Peter in an application for the creation of a Village Green. The

knowledge required to make these applications was gained from her membership of the Open Space Society and the Ramblers Association.

She attended Plymouth University as a mature student gaining a degree in Politics and Social Policy. This was followed by a Certificate in Education from Exeter University. To broaden her teaching area, she added Basic Skills qualifications which lead to assisting adult learners in the local college.

Gloria now enjoys a busy retirement with lots of grandchildren to visit.

### Katherine Anne Langley

Born in Redruth Hospital to Cornish parents, Kathryn Anne lived as a child in Par Lane and St Blazey Gate. She then moved to homes in Boscoppa, Tregrehan, Biscovey and Bodelva. She has only ever lived in this particular area of Cornwall. The local beaches at Carlyon Bay have been used regularly all her life. Her families can be tracked back into the 1600's.

She was employed for 13 years within the ECC Group of companies, followed by 3 years at The National Trust and 15 years at Restormel Borough Council involved with planning administration and committee work. She left in 2001. In the 1990's she and her husband ran a pick-your-own fruit business called Bodelva Berries. Kathryn currently runs her own B & B business.